“Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government”
September 2011 – September 2015

A MID-TERM PROJECT EVALUATION REPORT

Authored by:
Dr. Virginia Khan
Ms. Humera Hussain
Acknowledgements

The evaluation team would like to thank the management and staff members of SFCG Pakistan for their support, facilitation and assistance in conducting the evaluation. We also appreciate the time given by the SFCG Global Director for Leadership and Training, who discussed the project with us from an airport lounge in Istanbul.

We are grateful to the women who kindly gave their time and energies to attending FGDs and giving interviews. They provided the insight and perceptions that constitute the content of the report. Several travelled long distances from their homes to the Provincial capitals to take part in the evaluation. One participant in Lahore was ill with typhoid, but spent an hour with the team. All recalled their experiences at the trainings and media events and addressed our questions seriously and graciously. We also greatly appreciate the fact that several people agreed to let us use their perceptions and experiences in case studies.
Executive Summary

This report describes the process and results of designing, conducting and analyzing the findings of the Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) of the Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government Project implemented by Search for Common Ground Pakistan between September 2011 and August 2013, the original closing date. First conceived as an end-of-project evaluation, it was re-conceived as an MTE when a 2-year extension (until 2015) was granted.

The report identifies the themes, issues and questions which informed the MTE, resulting in the questionnaires and guidelines included in the Annex. These were based on the literature review and on interviews with the SFCG Project staff in Islamabad. The report also contains a list of recommendations made by the MTE participants, including the Implementing Partners and the evaluation team, based on the evaluation findings.

The project beneficiaries/participants were either elected or aspiring women politicians. A total of 75 current MPAs (elected in 2008), and 90 former or aspiring District and Union Councillors benefitted from the project. The project beneficiaries were from all four Provinces as well as FATA. Their perceptions and assessments of the project, and their expressions of its value to them, are included in the report.

Methodology
The MTE was qualitative in nature. In addition to interviewing the SFCG Pakistan Country Office management and staff and the heads of the implementing partner organizations, interviews and focus group discussions were held with beneficiaries. The MTE participants were nominated by SFCG Pakistan. The evaluation also assessed the WILL Facebook page and the WILL documentary.

This report does not claim to be fully representative of all 208 women leaders who participated in the project, but it does present the assessments and insights about the project of 26 of those women.

Significant Findings
The implementation mechanism (i.e. the formation of a 3-part Consortium), was effective in organising training events and leadership forums for selected women MPAs, ex Councillors and aspiring women leaders as well as training media presenters and producers on common ground media and in achieving the project targets. The learning materials and the training events were appropriate for the project purpose. The selection of beneficiaries (as noted above) included a good ‘mix’ of Members of Provincial Assemblies, women who were former Councillors and aspiring politicians. This was a strategic decision which was in line with the intention to bring the three categories of women leaders together for their mutual benefit, as noted in the report.

The project beneficiaries/participants were either elected or aspiring women politicians, from all four provinces. A total of 75 current MPAs (elected in 2013), and 90 former District and Union Councillors or aspiring women leaders for District and Union Council positions benefitted from the project. The project trained a significant number of MPAs i.e. 58% of the total of 128 women MPAs attended the trainings, which is 22.7% of those in Punjab, 52% of those in Sindh, 51.7% of those in Balochistan and 68% of those in KP.

---

1. The District-level Government system had functioned from 2001 to 2009. It was abrogated in 2009 and the restored in 2013. The local Councillors referred to in this report had been elected to District and Union Councils during the time when the Local Governments were in effect. ‘Aspiring’ politicians were the women who plan to run for election in the reconstituted District and Union Councils when the elections are held in 2013 and 2014.
2. The local Councillors referred to in this report had been elected to the District and Union Councils. ‘Aspiring’ politicians are the women who plan to run for election in the now-reconstituted local Councils.
This can be considered a ‘critical mass’ of women MPAs who have been exposed to the project’s ideas and who have made commitments to the objectives of strengthening women leaders’ voices.

The MTE participants, who belonged to a number of political parties, were all positive in their appraisal of the project, noting that it was relevant to their needs for information and awareness and that they had acquired new skills that would be useful to them in their personal/familial and professional/political lives. The report includes numerous examples of participants saying that the project had equipped them to resolve conflicts brought to them by their constituents; and to network and communicate more effectively within their political parties and with politically-active women across party lines. They are also able to interact more effectively with the media and many are now taking the initiative in approaching the media on issues relevant to themselves and to the women in their communities. In summary, at the mid-point, the evaluation finds that the project’s objective of increasing the visibility of elected and aspiring women leaders have been met. A statement in the Insan Trust’s final report was made about its own efforts but summarizes the entire project’s achievements to date, very well: “ … [the] project has been able to develop a chain between parliamentarians, potential leaders, civil society members and development sector representatives across the country, regardless of party affiliations and without distinction of caste and religion”.

The project and its aims and achievements are now visible in the political and media ‘landscapes’ of Pakistan, by virtue of the WILL campaign. The WILL website is dynamic and informative and is a good platform for the WILL ambassadors, i.e. politicians and others who espouse the goal of spreading knowledge about women leaders. Thus the achievement of the goal of “… magnifying women’s voices” is off to a very strong beginning. Since WILL is a relatively recent initiative, having been launched in January 20133, and since SFCG Pakistan is committed to sustaining it, the WILL campaign will develop in significance in the future.

Conclusions
The consortium, consisting of SFCG Pakistan and three implementing partners, functioned well and achieved its objectives within the designated timeframe. The financial arrangements were implemented efficiently and financial and other support (e.g. logistics and monitoring and evaluation) was done well.

As noted in examples throughout this report, the outcomes of the project at the mid-point are congruent with a ‘theory of change’ that assumes that learning accrues first in the personal realm (for example, increasing women’s confidence to accomplish changes), and affects the wider social and the political domains. Both at the local (District) and Provincial levels, more women leaders are now better able to express their ideas and needs as political actors.

The evaluation team found ‘platforms for learning’ have been created and may be considered sustainable. For example, by bringing District and Provincial women leaders together - one aspect of the project’s innovative methods - the project activities have created environments which have enabled horizontal and vertical networking among women politicians. As noted by the Project Manager, the District Councillors bring ‘grassroots’ issues to the attention of the MPAs, who are in a position to respond to them because they are closer to the political leadership. The MPAs benefit by having a broad base of information and communication with the ‘grassroots’ i.e. people in the communities.

It cannot be over-emphasized that the kind of positive public discourse on women politicians produced by the media stream of the project is largely absent in Pakistan, which makes the contributions described here both unique and very valuable.

The WILL campaign, which will grow in the second phase of the project4, will contribute to ensuring that the learning continues. The video documentary can be shown in many political and social forums and will carry the message that women politicians and leaders are willing and able to respond to constituents’ needs. The

---

3 As per the WILL Facebook page, which shows the date and year that the campaign was launched.
4 As noted in interviews with the SFCG Pakistan Country Director and the Project Manager
radio programs are in the archives of the Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation and a number of private FM stations and can be used as resource in future to highlight similar issues. These programmes can be referenced in similar initiatives in the future. The WILL Facebook page is also a medium for raising issues pertaining to women political actors and civil society and for sharing good practices.

Selected Recommendations

1. Although the project was modeled on SFCG’s Global programming, there is no evidence of it bringing in learning from other countries. This may be related to the fact that this was the first time such a project has been implemented in Pakistan, and to the need for relevant contextualizing within Pakistan. However, factors such as the length of time allotted to training programs and the fact that in other countries ongoing refresher courses were held for master trainers suggest that a review of these previous and ongoing programs (in Indonesia and Zanzibar for instance) could yield insights that could be useful for Pakistan.

2. Co-ordination with and among the partners could be strengthened to enable it to function even more effectively as an interactive body for making decisions based on common grounds. The Consortium could also work to establish direct links with political parties, in a second phase of the project.

3. SFCG could consider strengthening its own expertise in managing a consortium, since it is a new organization in Pakistan and it can be very difficult to create a ‘space’ in which to bring in new ideas, no matter how useful those ideas are. Managing the complexities of multi-partner interactions requires specialized skills, and learning from other ‘best practices’ in South Asia and elsewhere could be useful. SFCG Pakistan could also contribute its learning to a wider discussion on the subject, in light of the rapidly-changing political, economic and security situations in Pakistan. Perhaps SFCG Global could provide some guidance from its experience in other countries in this regard.

4. In order to maximize the benefits of the training program for participants, and if it is feasible (and budgeted for in the second phase of the project) SFCG could hold another round of training sessions as soon as possible after the Local Government elections have been held (the elections have so far been held only in Balochistan).

5. The media trainings could be extended to the management of public and private radio stations, since the decision-making about programming is in their hands.

6. The trainers who were also coaches should be trained in the specific skills of coaching and of coaching both elected and aspiring women politicians. A Coaching Manual would also be useful. Since coaching is a unique aspect of the SFCG project, this would make a broad contribution to the subject in Pakistan.

---

5 The full list of recommendations is contained in Section Five of this report.

6 As noted in the interview with Shawn Dunning, SFCG Global Director for Leadership and Training.
1.0 Introduction

The Context of the Project
The Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government project was designed “to increase the capacity of women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councilors by magnifying women’s voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels”. The need for such strengthening arises from numerous causes, as noted in the project proposal and in the Training Needs Assessment carried out at the beginning of the project. In a deeply patriarchal Pakistani society, most women tend to have little or no ‘agency’ (i.e. the power to make decisions and to speak out about issues that concern them). Many women politicians, who should be in a position to respond to issues concerning their women and men constituents, find themselves unable to interact as equals with their male colleagues and so remain ineffective. Another problem is that the majority of the elected women hold ‘reserved seats’, which renders them dependent on male politicians for funding and relatively powerless within the political parties to which they belong. As noted in the project proposal to DRL, “they lack confidence, relevant parliamentary experiences, and basic knowledge and skills in legislative work. As a result of this, women have not been able to forge effective alliances, networks and linkages with stakeholders inside and outside parliament”.

The Project’s Goals and Objectives
In order to address the lack of confidence, relevant parliamentary experience, and basic knowledge and skills on legislative work among women leaders in Pakistan, as well as to address their ability to address conflict and build consensus, the project intended “to increase the capacity of women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councilors” by magnifying women’s voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels”.

The objectives of the project are threefold:

i) To equip elected women parliamentarians and former and aspiring women councilors with coalition and consensus building skills and enable them to advocate more effectively for a variety of issues, including women specific issues.

ii) To empower trainers and facilitators from national women’s organizations as agents of reform and change; and to provide effective political leadership training at the provincial and local levels in Pakistan.

iii) The complement of the capacity building was improving the public’s awareness and perception of the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers in government

Project Activities
To achieve these objectives, the project’s activities were:

i) A comprehensive training and capacity building program for the women leaders;

ii) A training program for local partners’ capacity building to empower their trainers/facilitators as agents of reform and change and enable them to provide effective political leadership training at the provincial and local levels;

iii) A media campaign intended to enhance public perceptions and awareness about the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers and the acceptance of women as competent and successful Members of Provincial Assemblies (MPAs) and District and Union Councillors. The campaign consisted of interactions with members of the print media, a series of interactive radio programs and the establishment of Facebook and Twitter pages.

7 The local Councillors referred to in this report had been elected to the District and Union Councils. ‘Aspiring’ politicians are the women who plan to run for election in the local Councils when these are re-constituted after the upcoming local elections.
2.0 The Mid-Term Evaluation

Objectives of the Evaluation
The primary objective of the MTE was to assess the relevance and effectiveness of the project activities against the current status of the outcomes. More specifically, it was intended to assess the relevance and effectiveness of project inputs from all sources; to determine the extent to which the project’s goals and objectives had been met and to elicit and to make suggestions for the second phase of the Project.

Evaluation Activities

1. Literature review

The Evaluation Team reviewed the following documents for the purpose of this mid-term evaluation: the project proposal and log frame; the Training Needs Assessment Report (May 2012), which were meant to function as a baseline against which to measure achievements; and the Training Manual on 'Effective Leadership, Conflict Resolution & Advocacy'. The team also reviewed seven quarterly reports submitted by SFCG Pakistan to the US Department of State, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor (DRL); the Coaching Manual and coaching reports; the concept notes for the four Leadership forums; the National Networking Summit report and the success stories generated by the project.

From the media perspective we reviewed the Media Messaging Manual, five radio programs (selected randomly from the pool of thirty recorded programmes provided by SFCG in a CD), the press releases, the Media Guide for Gender Sensitive Radio Programming and the video documentary titled A Journey of Learning and Leadership. We also reviewed the newspaper reports and articles, the WILL Facebook and Twitter pages and the project factsheet.

2. Inception Report

In the Inception Report, the evaluation team identified a number of themes, which informed the design of the evaluation interview questionnaires and guidelines. These included: the nature of the coordination between SFCG and the implementing partners; how the project activities built on and complemented each other to achieve the objectives; how the project is unique and innovative; the extent to which the capacity building activities link with the media activities and whether these are mutually supporting.

3. Interviews with SFCG Management and implementing partners

The evaluation team then interviewed the Executive Director SFCG, the SFCG Projects Manager, the Finance Manager and the former Assistant DM&E Manager. The team also held discussions with the Monitoring & Evaluation Officer and the Communications Manager, although both have been with the project for a short time and were not as yet able to comment in any depth on it. The team had several discussions with the SFCG Pakistan staff in charge of logistics and arrangements for the visits to the provincial capitals (Peshawar, Lahore, Karachi and Quetta) and for interviews in Islamabad, to be held after our return from the visits to the Provincial capitals.

The team held interviews with the heads of the three implementing partner Consortium members: the PAIMAN Alumni Trust, the Insan Foundation Trust and the Uks Resource Center (all in Islamabad). The purpose was to learn how the three implementing partners had met their discrete objectives and to what degree their combined efforts had contributed to the functioning of the consortium.

4. Interviews and Focus Group Discussions
The evaluation team held a total of 6 FGDs, two in Karachi, two in Lahore and one each in Peshawar and Quetta, with a total of 26 participants, 24 women who were former councilors and/or aspiring leaders and 2 former MPAs. The team also conducted 18 in-person interviews (6 with SFCG in-country staff, 6 with radio presenters, 3 with partner organization heads and 3 with Master Trainers) in the 4 provincial capitals. The team held 5 interviews for the purpose of recording success studies. In addition, the team held 2 telephone interviews with former MPAs (1 from Faisalabad and 1 from Sialkot) and had one Skype meeting with the SFCG Director for Leadership and Training.

Limitations of the Evaluation Methodology

Although the evaluation covered all 4 provinces and FATA, it was not possible to select a fully representative sample of respondents because of limited time and resources. Ideally, respondents would have been selected randomly from every District and from urban centres. With additional resources we would have also requested focus groups based on categories of respondents such as those elected in 2001 and 2005, and would have interviewed MPAs and Councillors as separate categories in order to gain their perspectives in light of their political experiences. This would have increased the geographical scope of evaluation.

Decisions about who would be interviewed or requested to attend a FGD were made by the SFCG M&E Officer, in consultation with his colleagues in the SFCG Country Office.

Security constraints inhibited the evaluation team’s ability to meet project participants in their districts of residence. The FGDs and interviews could only be held in the provincial capitals (rather than in the districts) because the security situation (i.e. frequent bombings, target killings and civil unrest) in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan made other travel hazardous there.

In Lahore and Karachi, the amount of time allocated to the MTE did not allow the evaluation team to travel to the districts and it was more efficient for the evaluation team to interview people from a single location. While this meant that participants from areas far from the major urban centers could not attend, it did mean that those participants who were able to attend had the opportunity to share project-related insights and experiences with each other.8

Other limitations were situational rather than systemic. For example, several people who had agreed to attend FGDs or to be interviewed could not do so. In Quetta, for example, although an FGD planned for November 9th was to have five participants, only one person arrived. Her willingness to cooperate allowed us to present an account of her political and social activism in a success story but no group discussion was possible. On another note, in one or two instances the people identified for ‘case studies’ had no insights to offer that could constitute a case study or success story, having attended a minimal number of project events. However, some instances of these women’s perspectives have been integrated into the report. Two of the radio presenters interviewed were not sufficiently knowledgeable about the project to make informed comments.

8 Several of the project beneficiaries travelled from other districts to attend the focus group discussions and to be interviewed.
9 The date was both a national holiday and the last date for filing nomination papers for the local government elections in Balochistan.
3.0 Evaluation Findings

3.1 Relevance

The project goal is relevant to the socio-political context (as identified in the project proposal and the TNA) in which women politicians and leaders in Pakistan must operate. It is also relevant to the participants’ desire for information. This point was made during the interviews and FGDs, in which the participants mentioned conflicts of numerous kinds that they have been called upon to address and resolve. Their ability to interact with the media had been limited before the project, leaving them unable to respond to queries or to contact the media themselves.

It is clear from the discussions held during the MTE that the participants were selected properly for the project. The evidence for this is as follows: the majority of elected Councillors and MPAs had received earlier training on the technical aspects of holding political office, having attended courses for District and Union Councillors held by UNDP, the Women’s Political School, the Aurat Foundation (an NGO) and the National Democracy Institution (an NGO), amongst others. The participants were actively engaged in their political parties, most of them in the ‘Women’s Wings’ of their parties. (The exceptions are the women who belong to the National Party in Balochistan, which has no Women’s Wing.) The majority also had long histories of engaging in what they called ‘social work’, i.e. helping people who came to them to solve problems of various kinds. Examples are drawn from all provinces and are mentioned later in the report. The knowledge acquired by the project participants in the previous trainings they had attended meant that the SFCG leadership-training program was based on a ‘common ground’ of awareness and knowledge, for the participants who had been elected previously.

Participants consistently praised the Lead Trainers from all three-partner organizations, appreciating both their personal and professional skills. They referred warmly to them by name and recalled the learning techniques that the Lead Trainers had employed in the workshops. One example is that of Ms. Nasreen Rehman (an ex MPA from Barkhaan, Balochistan), who said that “the training imparted by Ms Musarrat Qadeem [from PAIMAN] was a higher level training and it helped me to be a leader”. An ex-MPA from Sialkot said, “the conflict resolution training helped me to understand that one must stay positive in demeanor” [as a politician].

Regarding the relevance of the Leadership, Conflict Resolution and Advocacy manual’s content to Pakistan’s context, the SFCG Director of Leadership &Training) said that he was responsible for bringing SFCG’s global/foundational values and methods to the project and it was the responsibility of SFCG Pakistan to bring in content and examples from the Pakistan. He noted that the training facilitators brought in examples of content from Pakistan. He conveyed how the Common Ground Approach (i.e. adopting collaboration rather than antagonism; ‘embracing diversity’; finding ways of being supportive and drawing on compassion to heal divisions) can apply to addressing any kind of conflict. The content was almost entirely experiential, rather than using an ‘academic’ slide-lecture approach, which meant that local knowledge could be brought to bear. Also, the lessons and conclusions from the various parts of the training were drawn from the participants, rather than being devised or imposed by an outsider. This resulted in leadership “from the inside out”, which was appropriate in terms of the expressed perceptions of the project participants.

When asked about the usefulness of the radio programs, the radio presenters said that they found that such programs are important for awareness raising and they play a key role in influencing public opinion. They said that in the context of widespread power cuts in the country, radio remains an effective way to reach large numbers of people in both urban and rural areas. They also felt that programs focusing on issues that are important to women and men, and that focus on women’s public and domestic roles, can help to change societal perspectives of the role of women in politics.
The Master Trainers, FGD participants and the SFCG Leadership and Training Director, all said that the training sessions should have been longer. They indicated that neither one-day for the MPAs nor two days for the district participants was enough for building rapport and engaging in the experiential activities. Nor was the seven-day Training of Trainers (ToT) long enough to cover everything to the desired depth.

Forty to fifty per cent of the women interviewed use the Internet, Facebook and/or other social media. They have either set up accounts themselves or their adult children have done so, but the women leaders use these forums to remain in touch with (i) other women in their parties, (ii) people in their constituencies and in some cases with the NGOs with which they either volunteer or are employed. They are thus able to access the project website and Facebook page, and to refer their political and other colleagues and other to the sites. This has the advantage of informing a wide audience about the project.

The coaching activities can be said to have been relevant to the beneficiaries’ needs for information (for example on leadership qualities) and support (for example, when they encountered conflicts and wanted to discuss ways to resolve problems). Only a few of the MTE respondents had taken advantage of the coaching sessions (although in the course of the project the Insan Foundation Trust and PAIMAN both conducted 120 sessions (totaling 240 sessions). The women who had participated in the coaching sessions and responded on the subject during the MTE were very appreciative of the fact that the coaching was available and said that they had found it useful. There are several examples of effective coaching with positive outcomes from the MTR (including a respondent who noted that one of the Trainer/Coaches had visited her home to help with her learning).

3.2 Effectiveness

The project trained a significant number of MPAs: i.e. 58% of the total of 128 women MPAs attended the trainings, which is 22.7% of those in Punjab, 52% of those in Sindh, 51.7% of those in Balochistan and 68% of those in KP. This can be considered a ‘critical mass’ of women MPAs who have been exposed to the project’s ideas and who have made commitments to the objectives of strengthening women leaders’ voices.

Ninety eight percent of the MTE participants and interviewees were very positive in their response to the project. As noted in examples throughout this report, they consistently said that the events had added to their confidence, their leadership and advocacy skills and to their ability to address conflicts of various kinds. Some noted that the trainings had enhanced their sense of having the right to engage in political activities.

When asked if the SFCG trainings on leadership had added to their previous knowledge, the respondents, without exception, agreed that the trainings and leadership forums had enhanced their knowledge, especially in conflict resolution and in their capacity to interact with the media. A Master Trainer who had attended the ToT termed both the trainer and the contents of the training ‘excellent’. The other Master Trainers were also positive in their assessment. FGD participants in Quetta used the term ‘fabulous’ in describing the leadership training.

They particularly noted that the language of the training was ‘vivid and easy’. This was important because some training participants in Balochistan did not have high levels of formal education and were functionally not literate. The training, however, engaged everyone and made it possible for everyone present to be involved.

The participants also greatly appreciated meeting prominent women in politics, mentioning especially Dr. Fehmida Mirza, Pakistan’s first woman Speaker of the National Assembly and Dr Ayesha Siddiqua, a noted scholar. Since an important element of the SFCG approach had been to ensure that District and Provincial level politicians, both elected and aspiring, be brought together, the respondents’ appreciation of this confirms its value.

---

10 Output table, SFCG 8th Quarterly Report, September 2013, for the period ending September 30th.
As noted earlier, women in all of the FGDs cited numerous instances of increased personal confidence, which has helped them deal with matters within the Women’s Wings of their parties, with their parties at large and with the media, all of which are indicators of successful and sustainable project outcomes.

FGD participants gave many examples of these kinds of benefits. (See section 4.0 for other examples.) Women in the Peshawar FGD mentioned ‘learning to handle things on our own, instead of relying on men’; mediating disputes over the futures of young women; and helping girls to stay in school. One woman said that she had interacted with local police to have a boy who was harassing a girl arrested. She also formed a Conflict Resolution Committee, consisting of both men and women members, and has written a letter to the Chief Minister of KP requesting that a 10% quota be constituted in employing women in Government service. Another FGD participant mentioned that she had travelled to Nepal on a journey with women from several major NGOs. Another participant said that ‘she and her colleagues have progressed from being ‘workers’ to being leaders. These are examples of exposure to programs that build the confidence to accept opportunities that can change their lives.

It cannot be over-emphasized that the kind of positive public discourse on women politicians produced by the media stream of the project is largely absent in Pakistan, which makes the contributions described here both unique and very valuable.

The WILL campaign, which will grow in the second phase of the project, will contribute to ensuring that the learning continues. The video documentary can be shown in many political and social forums and will carry the message that women politicians and leaders are willing and able to respond to constituents’ needs. The WILL Facebook page is also an excellent medium for raising issues pertaining to women and for sharing good practices.

The Mid-Term Evaluation found that many respondents recalled the name of the WILL campaign and recalled the ‘raised hand’ symbol. A number of prominent politicians are WILL ambassadors, including the Honourable former Speaker of the House. Ample knowledge on the part of the project participants, especially at the District level, has yet to be achieved, in part because some of the women leaders do not use the Internet. To date over 200 people have visited the WILL Facebook page.

Achieving the goals for the campaign – “to work with social change enablers” and to function as a “social compass” – will require more time. The increased focus on the WILL campaign in the second phase will, however, be able to build on a strong foundation.

Radio Programs
The evaluators’ analysis of the radio programs, which were broadcast in all four provinces and Azad Kashmir and Gilgit Baltistan, is based on the information drawn from three different sources: a) our discussions with the radio presenters/producers; b) discussions with the women political leaders whom we interviewed in person or talked to on the phone; and c) listening to some of the programs. Radio producers and presenters who attended the ‘common ground media workshop’, organized by SFCG indicated that, although they had been working with radio stations for years and they do allocate time for women programmes, they had never carried out focused programmes on women’s rights, their political participation, or the role of women leaders in Pakistan’s democracy. So this SFCG initiative exposed them to the very important aspects of social and political life.

Another important point is the selection of topics for the programs: It was found that the media workshop participants selected these titles on their own during the workshop. In this regard, they did not find it difficult to transform the concept into a media product. ‘Focus’ was the key learning that they used across the programs to keep it productive and useful. PBC producers/presenters shared that the key learning that they received from the common ground workshop was, ‘how to do a live program’. Since the practice at PBC is to

---

11 This was mentioned in an interview with the Project Manager.
on air the recorded programmes and this practice never let them work/focus on the phenomenon of doing live programmes. So, they attributed this learning to the common ground media workshop that not only provided them with the skills to do it but also provided them with the opportunity to change their programming approach.

The women political leaders who were interviewed during the MTE applauded the radio program initiative. One example of the positive assessment from the women political leaders was that of Mrs Nasreen Altaf (an aspiring woman leader from Sanghar), who attended SFCG Leadership, Advocacy and Conflict Resolution Training and also listened to the radio programmes, shared in the FGD in Karachi that “the SFCG radio programmes are a great help to improve women’s portrayal as politicians”. Similarly, Mrs. Munir Alam (a seasoned politician and ex Union Council Nazim12 from Faisalabad) shared her opinion that “radio programmes provided an excellent opportunity to share women political issues in the public and such initiatives would help resolving issues with in the political parties like the issue of women representation in the party executive committees”. The overall opinion of the interviewed participants on the component of radio programmes from the awareness-raising point of view was positive and they suggested that along-term initiative in future should be initiated on the same pattern.

The evaluators’ own observation on the programs is that they are well structured and well presented, not only in terms of contents but also in the selection of panelists. Five out of thirty radio programmes were analysed. The criteria for assessing the radio programs were: the relevance of the program titles with current women’s political and social issues; the selection of panelists and their understanding and contribution on the above issues at the local level; the contents and arguments presented in the programme by the guests and the synchronicity with the micro and macro level issues. The programmes reviewed were broadcasted respectively from Bahawalpur, D.I Khan, Multan, Sialkot and Khairpur.

The review findings show that the topics were relevant to the issues of women politicians, and to their potential roles, problems and the future aspirations. The evaluation criteria for the radio programs included: relevance of subject matter, thorough and serious discussion of topics, inclusion of supporting evidence and selection of well-informed guests. Both male and female panelists were invited for the shows, which were a healthy trend and brought broader perspective (since it added perspective from both the sexes on political and social institutions). The panelists were found to have shared their experiences, observations and findings on the various aspects of political lives and discourses of women in the past decades and the present. Though there was no structured process for taking feedback in place from SFCG and the partners on the talk shows, the media presenters/producers with whom the evaluators met shared that they received calls and SMS message from the listeners and most of them were positive and appreciative. They also shared that the radio channels carry out listenership surveys’ but the top management directly supervises them and does not share findings with them.

Several FGD participants had shown the WILL documentary in their communities, where it had been greatly appreciated. This is the first activity of its kind in Pakistan and has provided a very good platform for initiating discussions and publicizing the impact of women politicians. For instance, the women felt privileged by the screening of the video in the presence of top women political leadership, since the event was inaugurated by the first ever woman Speaker of the National Assembly Dr. Fehmida Mirza and attended by many prominent women parliamentarians. This showcasing gave confidence to the SFCG training participants who were either the part of the documentary through their interviews or got filmed while performing various training activities. This whole concept of being the part of the documentary has raised the confidence of women politicians and aspiring councilors who on the evaluators’ probe on the documentary either responded with excitement for being the part of it or raised their voice with confidence that their peers were the part of it. Respondents in Lahore said that they are able to perform better and more effectively than their male or female counterparts who have not been exposed to the leadership or media trainings of this nature.

12 A Nazim is an elected official somewhat similar to a Mayor, in the Local Government system. An extremely small number of Nazims were women.
3.3 Implementing Mechanisms

1. Selection of Implementing partners

The choice of implementing partners was excellent, since all of them are well-grounded in the relevant subject matter and have long histories of involvement in the issues addressed by the project. PAIMAN, which implemented the training in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and Balochistan and parts of Sindh, has been training women in governance since 2006 and the Executive Director of PAIMAN has been engaged in training women on issues related to governance since the late 1980s and particularly with women parliamentarians (Provincial and National) since 2001. She also heads the Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN), which has country-wide links with political actors.

Uks is unique in the NGO sector in Pakistan in its focus on women in the media. Its expertise is unparalleled and its co-authorship with SFCG of the Media Messaging Manual has produced an excellent media resource that could be useful for a long time, especially if adapted for use on TV and on social media.

The Insan Foundation Trust (IFT), which implemented training sessions in Sindh and Punjab, has good connections with the media and with the Provincial Assembly members. It has been “working since 1992 in the field of peace, democracy and rights of women and children”\(^\text{13}\). These links helped to bring Parliamentarians to the training events. The IFT Executive Director noted that ‘most of the trainees were invited through personal connections’ but that if IFT is involved in a second phase of the project they would contact the women through their political parties. They felt that, initially, it was somewhat difficult to ensure that the trainees were ‘serious’ about the training but that their commitment developed as the training events succeeded each other and as the participants developed rapport with each other.

The Consortium approach

As noted by the SFCG Country Director and the Project Manager, the project provided the opportunity for synergies between the partners, but those have been somewhat difficult to achieve. The difficulties appear to centre on expectations and communication. In terms of expectations, PAIMAN had been involved in formulating the initial project\(^\text{14}\), and had expected that the training content would build directly on (i.e. would add to) the content of previous trainings held by the UNDP and NGOs, including PAIMAN, since the year 2000. However, the SFCG team noted that the focus of the project was on conflict resolution, advocacy and consensus building, rather than on the subjects covered in previous training courses. The media partner Uks expressed the idea that the consortium could have allowed more ‘space’ for the partners’ own ideas to be expressed, although it was part of the SFCG methodology to include partners and beneficiaries (including the media participants) in the design and content of the activities.

In terms of the quality of the communication the partners felt that on some occasions the communication with SFCG could have been improved. For example, PAIMAN mentioned that they were not initially informed about the Insan Foundation’s role in the project.

The partners and some of the Master Trainers felt that more inter-partner meetings at the inception stage would have enabled them to know each other better and to acquire deeper understanding of the aspects of the project. The partners’ participation in consortium meetings and the initiative was rather inconsistent\(^\text{15}\), which led to some issues in co-ordination and less than ideal across-the-board co-operation. It is the case that one meeting during the inception phase and 2 further all-partner consortium meetings had taken place. The idea for more meetings was an indication of the desire for more interaction to achieve better mutual understanding. No specific numbers for additional meetings were suggested.

\(^{13}\)Fifth Quarter report, April to June 2013.  
\(^{14}\)Interview with the Executive Director of PAIMAN.  
\(^{15}\)As noted by the SFCG Project Manager
The evaluators note that any effort to create and maintain a consortium – ideally a partnership of equals on a common ground brought together to meet project goals and objectives – can be difficult. Having years of experience and deep expertise do not necessarily mean being willing to ‘buy in’ to a project’s concepts and practices. Achieving synergies (i.e. something that is more than the sum of the parts) in addition to achieving objectives and targets is even more difficult, as was indicated by SFCG. Despite the difficulties, the consortium has worked to accomplish the objectives and meet the targets.

Adapting to contexts
The project adapted well to the evolving political and security scenarios. Some of these factors were foreseen in the TNA (including the general election) but the dangers of bombings and target killings were of course unpredictable. The 18th Amendment to the Constitution, which transferred many powers from the Federal to the Provincial Governments and the May 2013 General Election, also required adjustments of the schedule. The Insan Foundation Trust office in Rawalpindi was attacked when the SFCG project had just begun, and the organization had to find a new office, which led to some difficulties although not to major changes in the schedule of events.

In terms of budget allocations both the SFCG Pakistan Finance Manager and the partners agreed that the donor, the Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor (DRL) of the United States Department of State, had been provided sufficient funding to meet program needs and was flexible in adapting to evolving circumstances and making budgetary adjustments based on expressed needs. Rigorous accounting systems are in place and SFCG provided assistance to some of the partners in bringing their financial systems in line with the donor requirements.

It was noted by the SFCG Finance Manager that not all of the partners had the capacity to spend the allocated funds within the agreed time frames. SFCG’s flexibility and understanding of difficulties beyond the implementing partners’ control (for example when threats to security made it impossible for the women to move about safely) were appreciated by the partners. The SFCG Pakistan Finance Manager supported the partners in strengthening their financial systems for this project and aligning those systems with each other so that all partners could report efficiently. SFCG Pakistan thus functioned as a helpful and effective ‘bridge’ between SFCG, the partners and DRL.

The partners implementing the training and leadership programmes, for their part, indicated that funds had been transferred on time and that the program management, including fund transfers, had been efficient. The exception is Uks, which was less than satisfied with both the funding amounts and the choice of locations for the media events, indicating that the latter were not ideal, in comparison with the locations for the leadership events. However, since the partners were responsible for managing the events, including the choice of venue, the responsibility for this lies with the partner.

The Training Needs Assessment (TNA) was delivered in May 2012, seven months later than planned, so could not play the desired role in designing the trainings or media events. However, the TNA contains an excellent discussion of the problems that constitute the context for political activity in Pakistan - and indeed the social context in which women politicians must function in Pakistan. The TNA also anticipated some of the factors that might have impeded the timely implementation of activities although others could not have been foreseen. The floods of 2011 in Punjab and Sindh were among these latter factors. The TNA report will be very useful when the end-of-project evaluation is conducted.

16 The Uks 4th Quarterly report mentions that “at least nine people were killed and 56 injured when bombs ripped through election offices of three candidates in Kohat and Peshawar and the convoy of a candidate came under attack in Swabi on 28th April”. This example gives some idea of the dangers which political actors faced during the elections.

17 The overall allocation was 20% for the DC office, 25% for SFCG Pakistan and 55% for the partners.
Another major factor that had to be addressed was the timing of political events: primarily the May 2013 General Election, which preoccupied those women running for office as MPAs. The security situation (i.e. suicide bombings and target killings) made it difficult for participants to attend some events and often, politicians were the targets of these attacks (e.g. as noted in the Uks Fourth Quarterly Report). Several MPAs included in the mid-term evaluation noted that their parties’ demands on their time – and their election campaigns - had to take precedence over project activities.

Even without such major problems, organising the required project events was a complex matter, since it required coordinating the schedules of the individual Provincial Assembly members with the schedules of the Councillors. These are all women who are busy with political party and community issues, as well as with their familial responsibilities.

PAIMAN expressed some frustration with the training manual, since, they said, the organisation was not allowed to adapt the Manual once it had been approved. PAIMAN also indicated that, from its perspective, the manual was less than ideal because it lacked content on governance, caucus building, ways of raising issues in Parliament, how to align with male politicians, pro-gender legislation and “how women should carry themselves as leaders”. However, the purpose of the leadership training sessions was to build skills related to conflict recognition, analysis and resolution, rather than the points raised by PAIMAN.

Uks was pleased with the outcomes of the innovative radio program training, which brought together Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation and private FM producers and presenters. Some ‘mock programs’ were produced which integrated a gender-specific focus. SFCG Pakistan had provided useful guidelines for the training.

In terms of consortium coordination Uks expressed some dissatisfaction with what they felt were unrealistic requirements to arrange events on short notice. Specifically, they were dependent on PAIMAN for lists of participants, which were sometimes incomplete and required what Uks considered to be a lengthy and complex confirmation process.

Organising the training events was a complex matter for everyone involved, since it required coordinating the schedules of the individual Provincial Assembly members with the schedules of the Councillors, all of them women who are busy with political and community issues. However, it was managed effectively by all partners.

**Training**

The Insan Foundation was positive about the methods and the Uks Master Trainer interviewed considered the ToT to have been excellent. The SFCG monitoring reports from the training sessions indicate that all of the participants had fully participated in the techniques and had enjoyed doing so. In the evaluation FGDs and interviews the participants recalled that they had enjoyed the teaching methods and had learned useful lessons from them. The women leaders interviewed recalled the names of specific techniques such as the ‘Consensus Knot’ and the ‘Orange Negotiation’ and were enthusiastic about what they had learned about the context of conflicts, how to analyze conflicts and leadership.

Uks had initially found it difficult to convince experienced radio producers to take part in a ‘learning circle’ or to convince them that an extended discussion of gender and media issues (e.g. harassment, isolation, hierarchies and patriarchy and the lack of funds for women politicians) was necessary. However, ultimately the required level of involvement was achieved, as expressed in the opinion of the Uks staff and by Mr. Kashif Rana, one of the media Master Trainers interviewed during the MTE.18

---

18 See Section Four of this report for a case study on Kashif Rana’s background and experience with the SFCG Pakistan project.
4.0 Increased Capacities Resulting from the Project

This section of the evaluation report identifies some of the kinds of changes that can be attributed directly to the project. These range from the personal to the social and political. Some of these examples are presented in the context of issues the women have faced; others are narratives, which the evaluation team gathered from women leaders who had participated in the project.

“Now we have the knowledge and capacity to talk to Government officials”. Madam Nargis, former Councilor and current PTI party member, KP.

In Lahore, participants said they have addressed gender-based and domestic violence. In one instance of an ‘acid attack’ a woman said that she had stopped the police from harassing the victim who was in the Intensive Care Unit. The same women then raised the issue with Punjab’s Chief Minister, who helped to get the culprits arrested. She had also helped a number of women to receive free legal aid during family disputes.

In Karachi, four of the FGD participants mentioned that they are now able to interact with the police, which is an indication of their empowerment, as it links them to the legal system. The movement from inability to ability, with its attendant concept of entitlement, is significant for all of the women, especially since some of the ex-Councillors are not literate.

An FGD participant in Lahore indicated that she is now much better equipped to take part in debates on the allocation of development funds to women holding reserved seats, which is a significant improvement, as her and other women’s lack of knowledge had left them open to being ignored or even exploited in earlier instances.

The women interviewed in Balochistan noted that they must deal with the fact that theirs is a tribal and feudal society and that these factors limit their ability to function as politicians. They found the “group activities and learning opportunities to be excellent”, and felt the training had strengthened their determination to overcome these difficulties.

Almost all respondents in all provinces said that their ability to deal with the media had improved. For example, the women interviewed in Karachi said that their ability to speak in public had increased, following the media training sessions. While most examples given detailed more positive and effective relations with the media, one FGD participant said she had endured a conflict with a newspaper and had had the confidence to sue a newspaper for publishing a false story about her, which indicated that women leaders are empowered to challenge the media for securing justice.

Zeeshan Hashmi, an FM station presenter from Sargodha, attended the media training and later recorded a program that was aired. He found the training very useful, noting that he learned that a presenter has to remain neutral and not make judgments but also must stay focused on the purpose of a specific program. He had interviewed two women Councilors on his program and had to make sure that their initial antagonism to each other did not sidetrack the program. He said that he would like to see more radio programs on the challenges faced by women, in general, and women politicians in particular.

Women Leaders bringing large-scale benefits to women constituents
Shahida Bibi, who belongs to the PML(N) party, and is from Mardan District in KP, has been elected unopposed twice as a District Councilor. She says “Now we have the capacity to handle local issues” and

\[19\] An ‘acid attack’ occurs when a person throws acid at another person. It is unfortunately not uncommon in Pakistan, with most of the victims being women. The victims usually do not survive. Those who do survive are disfigured and/or blinded and traumatized for the rest of their lives. An award winning video was produced on the subject in 2012. Given this climate of violence against women the actions of the woman mentioned here, in going to the police on behalf of the victim, is courageous and deserves mention as a form of leadership.
attributes some of this ability to the SFCG project. The third time she stood for election she won over her opponent by a wide margin. By coordinating with NADRA she has helped close to 600 women to get their Computerized National Identity Cards, which entitle them to claim rights and benefits from the State. It is a remarkable accomplishment for a woman who had to overcome stiff resistance to the idea that women could engage with bureaucracies in the public domain.

In another example of large-scale effect, MPAs from Lahore had distributed 2,000 forms to economically marginal women, to enable them to become eligible for funding from the Benazir Income Support Project.

CASE STUDIES

1. Mrs Nasim Riaz (Peshawar, KP)

Mrs Nasim Riaz has been in politics since 2001, and has served her constituency in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province as an elected Councilor twice. She and her family have faced some opposition from local residents but her husband has consistently supported her participation, which she credits in part for her ability to remain involved in a field to which she is dedicated. She married her husband when she was only 13, and continued to study as a ‘private’ student, earning a Master’s degree in Arabic. She is now studying for a Master’s degree in Urdu. She is proud to say that all 5 of her children are well-educated. They have also been supportive, but now want her to ‘take a rest’ as they worry that she is spending too much of her time and energy on solving other people’s problems.

Mrs Nasim Riaz has had an unusual career. She attended the Women Political School training given by the Aurat Foundation, an NGO, as well as attending training events given by SAP PK, the highly-respected NGO Khwendo Kor, the Job Development Creation Society and EIROP. She then left politics in 2009 after the suspension of the Local Bodies until 2012, when she attended the PAIMAN training for the Search for Common Ground project.

She joined the PML (N) party since 2012 and is the Provincial Coordinator of the Women’s Wing of the party. She is a trusted colleague of the President of the Wing.

Her area is unusual, in that half of it is in the Province and the other half is in the Khyber Agency Tribal Area. This means that different political and administrative practices are in place. Since she lives in an area that is known for its conservative attitudes to women, she and her family have faced some opposition from local residents, including some branches of their extended family, who consider it inappropriate for a woman to engage in politics. Her family once faced a ‘boycott’ arising from this disapproval but they persevered. Her husband has consistently supported her participation, however, which she credits in large part for her ability to remain involved in a field to which she is dedicated.

During the 2005 Local Bodies election Nasim Bibi showed great bravery in ignoring the threats made against women voters. A local male politician threatened that women who voted would “have their thumbs cut off”, but she and many women cast their votes anyway. She also had to take part in a dialogue with men who wanted to stop women from voting.

Like many of the women Councilors who have attended the SFCG leadership and advocacy events Nasim Bibi considers her social work to be her foundation in addressing community issues. She helps people to address issues such as girls’ education and she ran a private school for girls which had 95 girls enrolled. She regularly attends Party meetings, which are frequent because the Party does not maintain a ‘vote bank’: instead, the members encourage others to join the party and solicit votes during campaigns. As is the case with all political parties, the issue of giving ‘tickets’ (i.e. allotting them the right to stand as a candidate) to women is complex and Nasim Bibi acknowledges some disappointment in her Party’s refusal to give her a

---

20 This Government scheme provides very poor families with a PKR 2,000 (approximately US$ 20) per month income supplement.
ticket. She had to raise 75,000 Rupees (about US$ 750) in order to be considered a contender for a ticket within her party, but was not selected. The issue of ‘reserved seats’ for women is relevant to Nasim Bibi’s story, and that of all other women who would like to stand for election. The parties give tickets to men politicians and reward the men by ‘appointing’ the women in their families to the reserved seats. She is also disappointed by the way the Women’s Wing functions, since some of the members are intent on working for their male relatives.

Far-sighted and courageous, Nasim Bibi credits the Search for Common Ground project with enhancing her confidence to be a politician, as well as her skills in conflict resolution, leadership and networking. She admires a number of other women politicians who she feels “work selflessly” to benefit others. She herself is a mentor to several other women politicians. Equipped with better knowledge of women’s electoral rights, she is committed to reforming unfair practices. She is now intent on meeting the daughter of the head of the PML (N) and asking her to consider the issue of women and party tickets and possibly reforming the process so it is more transparent and more fair to women. She is one of the many women interviewed in the Mid-Term Review who believe that men politicians should also be given the knowledge that women have received, noting that the eventual outcome could be that men will start treating women as equals. She strongly supports the creation of a Women’s Caucus both in the Parliament and in the Local Government. She is firm in stating that leadership is about being proactive, defining a leader as “a person who works selflessly for a collective cause” and who does not take credit but works to inspire others”. She is proud to be one of the women featured in the WILL documentary.

2. Kashif Rana, Master Trainer: Building Women’s Skills for Interacting with the Media

Confidence and experience combine with a genuine sense of appreciation and desire to learn continuously in Kashif Rana, one of the Master Trainers and Coaches for the project. He has worked as a political correspondent for the leading national and international newspapers in Lahore for 15 years. He considers the Effective Media Messaging training contents and methods to have been ‘superb’ and better than any other event he has attended. The level of detail was greater than any other event he has attended. He notes the difficulties experienced by most Pakistani women politicians: most of them are not taken seriously by the media and many have no experience in conveying their ideas in ways that the media will accept. On the other hand, a few women politicians consider that the media should accept their every word, so the need in the training course was to bring these two perspectives onto a ‘common ground’.

The two-fold purpose of the training course was to help the participants craft their ideas into ‘media messages’ and to develop the skills needed to contact and interact with print and radio journalists. These skills were very much in demand during the run up to the 2013 general election. Some of the women Parliamentarians even asked Kashif to organize coaching sessions for their male counterparts!

As only one example of several successful outcomes of the training and coaching, he cited a former MPA who participated in a TV talk show. These are often volatile events and require poise and self-control in holding to a point of view. Kashif was also asked to coach several politicians in one-on-one sessions following the training course. In one case, a former MPA needed to know how to convey her party’s position on a contentious issue. Kashif helped her design a ‘roadmap’ which she then used to first express her understanding of the position to her party leadership and then to convey it to the media. Similarly, a group of women MPAs from Faisalabad invited Kashif to coach them on the techniques he had acquired during the SFCG training. He also notes that male politicians could benefit from the training courses.

When asked how long it might be before the skills are fully absorbed and it becomes easier and more ‘natural’ for women politicians to address the media and be taken seriously, Kashif responded that it might take at least two terms of the Legislature. New women join the Provincial Assembly each term, party affiliations can change, and learning itself is always evolving to meet changing needs.
3. Mrs Amna Zaidi, Lifelong Politician (Lahore)
Mrs. Amna Zaidi of the Pakistan People’s Party has been interested in politics since she was in Class 9. Her father was a political worker who was victimized several times by General Zia. Inspired by Benazir Bhutto, Amna’s passion for politics has led her to hold several elected positions. Elected as a District Councilor in 2001 and 2005, she wanted to contest a seat in the 2013 general election but was refused a ticket. She then ran as an independent candidate in NA 146 and came third. She was the Naib Nazim (Deputy Mayor) of Union Council 48, Aziz Bhatti Town in Lahore from 2005 to 2009, and the first woman to hold the position. She was also a member of the Regulation Committee there. She is now determined to run for office as a contestant in the upcoming Local Bodies election.

She speaks highly of the Insan Foundation Trust training she attended in 2012, which was the first she had experienced. She says it gave her ‘so much knowledge and courage’ that now she can express her feelings and convey her understanding of issue in a clear way. She thinks it was valuable for all who attended, since ‘so many women enter politics without a basic knowledge of how to act appropriately or how to talk about policy issues or how to take part in formulating policy’. She credits the training with giving her the courage to stand her ground when her party refused to give her a ticket and tried to persuade her to support the candidacy of the selected candidate. Amna says she ‘knows her own self better than she did before’, having done a self assessment during the training. She will stay in politics and use her political skills to help other women, confident that eventually women will achieve equality.

4. ‘Finding Her Feet’ for a Political Career: Ms Nasreen Rehman, Balochistan
Despite all of the difficulties experienced by women who want to be in politics in Balochistan, some are able to find the support they need within their families and to thrive in a political atmosphere. Mrs. Nasreen Rehman, who belongs to the PML (Q) and who served two terms as an MNA, is one of those women. She has served as a Provincial Minister twice: once as the Minister for Zakat21 and once for Population Welfare. Her career and these appointments are unique, since tribal custom most often restrict women to their homes. These loyalties also condition the extent to which a woman can participate in politics, in the few cases where this is allowed.

She is of the leaders featured in the WILL documentary. Although she is now 60, her passion for politics and the rights of women is as strong as ever. She was the first woman in her family to contest a seat as an MNA and was successful both in 2002 and 2007. Her husband has always been supportive, which helps tremendously. She credits the trainings she has taken with NDI, WP3 and the Aurat Foundation for helping her ‘find her feet’ in politics. The SFCG training she did with PAIMAN contributed greatly to her ability to understand the meaning and expression of leadership. Deeply committed to ‘social work’, she helps women who come to her with problems in their families.

She would like to be an even better advocate for women’s rights, since these are few and far between in Balochistan, but cautions that widespread social awareness must be created first, or advocacy will have no fertile ground in which to take root and find a responsive audience. On this note, she says she learned a lot from the media-messaging workshop and was able to organize a number of press conferences in Quetta after attending it. She is now often invited to speak on radio programs and would like to do programs on women’s rights, women and the law and education in Balochistan. She credits SFCG and PAIMAN with giving her the technical knowledge to frame a resolution and to understand a point of order in the Assembly. She now knows how a Parliamentary Committee functions. Ever thirsty for knowledge, she would like to pursue a Master’s degree in political science.

---

21 The money donated by all Muslims to be distributed to the poor and needy.
5.0 Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Conclusions
The consortium, consisting of SFCG Pakistan and three implementing partners, functioned well and achieved its objectives within the designated timeframe. The financial arrangements were implemented efficiently and financial and other support (e.g. logistics and monitoring and evaluation) was done well.

As noted in examples throughout this report, the outcomes of the project at the mid-point are congruent with a ‘theory of change’ that assumes that learning accrues first in the personal realm (for example, increasing women’s confidence to accomplish changes), and affects the wider social and the political domains. Both at the local (District) and Provincial levels, more women leaders are now better able to express their ideas and needs as political actors.

The evaluation team found that ‘platforms for learning’ have been created and may be considered sustainable. For example, by bringing District and Provincial women leaders together - one aspect of the project’s innovative methods - the project activities have created environments which have enabled horizontal and vertical networking among women politicians. As noted by the Project Manager, the District Councillors bring ‘grassroots’ issues to the attention of the MPAs, who are in a position to respond to them because they are closer to the political leadership. The MPAs benefit by having a broad base of information and communication with the ‘grassroots’ i.e. people in the communities.

It cannot be over-emphasized that the kind of positive public discourse on women politicians produced by the media stream of the project is largely absent in Pakistan, which makes the contributions described here both unique and very valuable.

The WILL campaign, which will grow in the second phase of the project, will contribute to ensuring that the learning continues. The video documentary can be shown in many political and social forums and will carry the message that women politicians and leaders are willing and able to respond to constituents’ needs. The radio programs are in the archives of the Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation and a number of private FM stations and can be used as resource in future to highlight similar issues. These programmes can be referenced in similar initiatives in the future. The WILL Facebook page is also a medium for raising issues pertaining to women political actors and civil society and for sharing good practices.

5.2 Recommendations
Recommendations for the second phase of the project are shown below. They are derived from the suggestions of (i) the MTR respondents, (ii) the implementing partners and (iii) evaluation team. However, the evaluation team understands that the resources may or may not be available for these suggestions to be implemented and those strategic decisions about phase II (to which we are not privy) may or may not be in line with these recommendations.

- Although the project was modeled on SFCG’s Global programming, there is no evidence of it bringing in learning from other countries. This may be related to the fact that this was the first time such a project has been implemented in Pakistan, and to the need for relevant contextualizing within Pakistan. However, factors such as the length of time allotted to training programs and the fact that in other countries ongoing refresher courses were held for master trainers suggest that a review of these previous and ongoing programs (in Indonesia and Zanzibar for instance) could yield insights that could be useful for Pakistan.

---

22 As noted in interviews with the SFCG Pakistan Country Director and the Project Manager
23 As noted in the interview with Shawn Dunning
It would be useful for the implementing partners to identify participants in the second phase of the project on the basis of a set criterion addressing the needs of phase II.

**Consortium Management**

- Co-ordination with and among the partners could be strengthened to enable it to function even more effectively as an interactive body for making decisions based on common grounds.

- SFCG could consider strengthening its own expertise in managing a consortium, since it is a new organization in Pakistan and it can be very difficult to create a ‘space’ in which to bring in new ideas, no matter how useful those ideas are. Managing the complexities of multi-partner interactions requires specialized skills, and learning from other ‘best practices’ in South Asia and elsewhere could be useful. SFCG Pakistan could also contribute its learning to a wider discussion on the subject, in light of the rapidly-changing political, economic and security situations in Pakistan. Perhaps SFCG Global could provide some guidance from its experience in other countries in this regard.

- Greater focus on the media would be useful, as would a shift to TV and the inclusion of training on social media, since these are increasingly powerful in influencing the public.

- Several of the MTE respondents suggested that SFCG should consider establishing direct links with political parties, in the second phase of the project. Their argument was that the men in the political parties operate in a framework of antagonistic power struggles. The women making this suggestion thought that the men might benefit from alternative ways of resolving political issues.

**Training**

- Several of the women leaders suggested that more extensive training sessions would be useful since they had found the ones they had attended to be beneficial. They wanted to learn: how to make a point of order in Parliament; how to develop a bill; what the Parliamentary rule of business are; specific mechanisms for building a caucus; how to draft legislation; the procedures for raising issues in Parliament, and how to align themselves with their male counterparts. On a similar note, a training program on Government systems and ways of engaging in advocacy should be organized by SFCG for those women who are elected in the upcoming Local Government.

- SFCG could consider including more content on “women’s issues” and gender, for Phase II, if resources permit. The respondents particularly expressed an interest in this. Although many of the women leaders have attended trainings on these subjects, many others have not. Men and women in the media also require gender-specific training, according to implementing partner Uks.

- The training manuals on conflict resolution and consensus building should be made available to the political parties. They could be of benefit in intra-party communication, conflict-resolution and decision-making. As noted by participants during the MTR, the political parties operate with antagonistic and very competitive methods.

- In order to maximize the benefits of the training program for participants, and if it is feasible (and budgeted for in the second phase of the project) SFCG could hold another round of training sessions as soon as possible after the Local Government elections have been held (this has happened so far only in Balochistan).

- The media trainings could be extended to the management of public and private radio stations, since the decision-making about programming is in their hands.
- The trainers who were also coaches should be trained in the specific skills of coaching and of coaching both elected and aspiring women politicians. A Coaching Manual would also be useful. Since coaching is a unique aspect of the SFCG project, this would make a broad contribution to the subject in Pakistan.

- SFCG Pakistan could consider outsourcing the evaluation of training events to a specialized third party. This would provide both evaluation expertise and a greater degree of objectivity to the process and could therefore yield more plausible results. The third party evaluator could design the evaluation forms based on their own professional criteria and standards.
ANNEXES

Annex A: Terms of Reference For Midterm Evaluation “Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government”

I. Introduction
Search for Common Ground (SFCG) is an international peacebuilding organization that strives to transform the way the world deal with conflict, away from adversarial approaches and towards collaborative problem solving. SFCG is working in 32 countries across Africa, Asia, the Middle East, Central Asia and the USA. SFCG works with governments, civil society, state institutions, youth, media organizations and other stakeholder groups to promote peace, tolerance and collaboration across dividing lines. SFCG began working in Pakistan in 2010, with its project ‘Radio for Peacebuilding’. In September 2011, SFCG Pakistan was awarded the Project ‘Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government’ by the US State Department, Bureau of Democracy, Rights and Labor (DRL). This Project works with provincial women parliamentarians, ex-councilors and aspiring female politicians (from across the four provinces in Pakistan), and radio professionals to promote women’s political participation and collaboration above party lines and improve public perception and awareness about the role of women as effective decision makers.

II. Background
Pakistan is a young democracy, and has just seen the first transition of power from one civilian government to the next in its 66-year history. Ensuring the incorporation of the voices of all its citizens - particularly women, who make up 48.6% of the total population1 - is increasingly important as the country moves towards strengthening democracy. In 2000, Pakistan adopted a gender quota policy under the Devolution of Power Plan, which reserved 33% seats in the local government2 and 17% seats in the national and provincial assemblies for women. This brought 128 women in the provincial assemblies in 20073. The reserved seats were allocated through an indirect election, which made the election of aspiring female candidates the prerogative of the male leadership of the political parties. In addition to the problems caused by indirect elections, most women parliamentarians were elected for the first time, and lacked the political and parliamentary experience as well as the basic knowledge and legislative skills required to be effective parliamentarians. Operating within a male dominated space, they were unable to forge effective alliances, networks and linkages with stakeholders inside and outside the parliaments. In light of these realities, SFCG implemented the project ‘Strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government’ in September 2011. SFCG adopted a consortium approach for the implementation of this project, and worked collaboratively with 3 local non-governmental organizations: PAIMAN Alumni Trust, Uks Resource Centre and Insan Foundation Trust.

The project seeks to support provincial women parliamentarians (2008-2013) and aspiring women councilors for effective leadership. Through effective and transformative leadership training in political advocacy, coalition and consensus building, SFCG and its partners sought to strengthen women’s voices to better represent the interests of their constituencies across Pakistan.

Additionally, this project also draws upon SFCG’s expertise in media, through programming that contributes towards shifting attitudes towards women’s participation in government and increasing awareness about issues effecting women.

2 Local Government elections have not taken place since 2005, when 28,550 women were brought into local bodies across the country. In 2009, the then Prime Minister of Pakistan, Syed Yousaf Raza Gillani dissolved the local bodies due to the security situation, and they have not yet been reinstated.
3 Role and Performance assessment of Pakistani Women Parliamentarians 2002-2007, pp.6
III. Project Objectives

The goal of the project was to increase the capacity of women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councilors by magnifying women’s voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels. The specific objectives of the project were:

- Elected women parliamentarians and former and aspiring women councilors are equipped with coalition and consensus building skills and are able to advocate more effectively for a variety of issues, including women specific issues;
- Trainers/facilitators from national women’s organizations are empowered as agents of reform and change and provide effective political leadership training at provincial and local levels in Pakistan
- The population’s awareness and perception of the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers in government is improved.

The expected outcomes of the project are:

- Elected women parliamentarians and future leaders trained to conduct consensus building activities
- Trainers/facilitators complete ToT in facilitation and conflict resolution skills and provide support to leadership trainees
- Media campaign and talk shows shift attitudes of public in favor of women’s role in policy decision making

The direct beneficiaries of the project are our local partners, provincial women parliamentarians, and former and aspiring women councilors at the district level across Pakistan.

IV. Project Activities

The activities are split in two streams: the capacity building activities and the media activities. The project activities and corresponding outcomes of this Action are:

A. Capacity Building Activities:
   i. Training Needs Assessment Study
   ii. Local Partner Capacity Building (ToT): (10 participants trained)
   iii. Advanced Facilitation Workshop
   iv. Pilot Testing of Tool Kit (15 participants)
   v. Capacity Strengthening Activities:
      a. Provincial Level Leadership, Conflict Resolution and Advocacy Workshop (75 participants)
      b. Provincial Level Effective Media Messaging Training Workshop (75 participants)
      c. District Level Leadership, Conflict Resolution and Advocacy Workshop (80 participants)
   vi. National Networking Summits
   vii. One-on-One Coaching (240 individual coaching sessions)
   viii. Leadership Forums

B. Media Activities:
   i. Message Development Stakeholder Meetings
   ii. Common Ground Media Workshop (30 participants)
   iii. Publicity and Promotion Campaign
   iv. Interactive Radio Talk shows (150 episodes)

V. Evaluation Objectives

The final evaluation will be designed to assess the overall approach, using a “theory-based evaluation” framework. While the evaluator may suggest which specific approach to adopt, SFCG recommends adopting a Theory of Change approach. The theory of change of this project is implicit within the design, and will have to be explicitly identified by the evaluator at the start of the evaluation.
Additionally, the evaluation will measure how the project was implemented and to what extent the project goals and objectives were achieved. The evaluation will measure how well the project responded to the needs of women parliamentarians, ex-councilors and aspiring female politicians through an assessment of relevance; measure the project’s effectiveness by assessing how well it achieved its objectives, outcomes and outputs; evaluate the program’s design, strategy and implementation strategy; and finally assess the management of the program, including the management of relationships with partner organizations.

The evaluation will encompass an analysis based on the OECD-DAC standard set of evaluation criteria, to answer some of the key questions listed in detail below.

1. Relevance/Appropriateness:
   - Are the project’s stated goals and objectives relevant to the issues central to the women politicians in Pakistan? Do the activities and strategies fit project objectives?
   - Is the project covering the appropriate leadership and media messaging themes and providing resources and capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen?
   - How relevant are the project strategies and activities as perceived by the beneficiaries and other community stakeholders?

2. Effectiveness:

   Has SFCG achieved its stated (or implicit) goals, objectives and outcomes over the life of the project?

   - Has SFCG achieved its goal of increasing the capacity of women parliamentarians (2008-2013) and aspiring women politicians, by magnifying their voices and bolstering their engagement in the decision-making processes?
   - To what extent the project has been successful in improving public awareness and perceptions about the role of women politicians?
   - Are there any signals of increased inclusion in decision-making processes of women politicians?
   - To what extent has the project contributed to enhancing the capacity of its partner organizations and their staff?
   - Has this project resulted in collaboration above party-lines between women politicians?
   - What major factors are contributing to the achievement or non-achievement of objectives?

3. Impact:

   Has the project been successful in transferring enough knowledge and skills to the participants to ensure effective and independent application of those skills in the future?

   - What change has taken place in the media’s approach to women politicians as a result of this project? Has the projection of women politicians in the media improved as a result of SFCG’s work?
   - How has the project contributed in improving the capacity of women politicians in Pakistan? How has SFCG’s engagement with women politicians translated into positive action or improvements in the position of women politicians in the public space?
   - Are there any unintended positive or negative results of this work in Pakistan?
   - How have Pakistani women politicians benefited from the SFCG’s work through this project?
   - How has the Pakistani media (radio?) benefitted from the SFCG’s work through this project?
4. Implementation Process:
- What is the comparison between the planning versus the implementation of the project activities?
- Are all activities delivered as planned? Are the reasons for delay (if any) justified under the prevailing context of Pakistan?
- Are all necessary tools and resources in place to ensure improved public awareness about women politicians and their role as effective decision makers?
- Is there effective monitoring of the project implementation? What are the mechanisms of the reflection and learning process?

5. Coordination:
- How smooth was the coordination, communication and synergy between SFCG and its implementing partners?
- How effective has the consortium approach been in the implementation of this project? What advantages or challenges were offered as a result of this approach during the implementation of the project?
- Were the planning and implementation processes participatory and inclusive?
- Is there any room for improvements?

VI. Evaluation Methodology
The final evaluation will be designed by the Evaluator and submitted to SFCG for approval. The evaluation must adopt a “Theory-based evaluation” approach. The final evaluation will employ quantitative and qualitative research tools. The following list of tools is recommended:
- a) Desk review of relevant documents (TNA, contracts, periodic reports etc.)
- b) Quantitative survey tools (a survey similar to the TNA carried out at the beginning of the project, perception survey)
- c) Focus Group Discussions
- d) Key Informant Interviews with participants, partner staff and beneficiaries
- e) Case studies and success stories
- f) Utilization of stories derived from Most-Significant Change Approach for analysis
- g) Field visits and observation.

A survey, similar to the one used for the training needs assessment must be employed to compare results and show the knowledge and skill changes on the part of the women leaders who participated in this project, combined with a survey to assess attitudinal changes in the general population. Quantitative data will be complemented and validated through stories from the target group through the use of the Most Significant Change (MSC) approach. In addition, this data will be triangulated by qualitative data from the different stakeholders to understand change in depth.

The Evaluator will be tasked with analyzing both quantitative and qualitative data. Existing project documents and reports will be shared with the evaluator prior to the evaluation starting to help inform the detailed design frame for the evaluation and to assist with the writing of the report.

VII. Scope of Work and Deliverables
The evaluation will take place nationally across Pakistan. The total number of working days for the evaluation will be 25, spread over a 40-day period.
The deliverables are listed below.

- Evaluation Inception Report
- Evaluation Action Plan detailing activities, along with field work schedule
- Field work
- First draft of preliminary findings
- First draft of Final evaluation findings
- SFCG Review and Comments on first draft
- Draft Final Evaluation Report
- SFCG review and comments on draft final evaluation report
- Submission and presentation of Final Evaluation Report to SFCG and partners
- All data collected, forms, audio recordings and other tools used

VIII. Logistics
SFCG will provide logistic support to the Evaluator. SFCG Pakistan’s Evaluation Manager (SFCG Pakistan DM&E Manager) will assist the Evaluator in logistics, travel, translation (if required), accommodation, communications, and scheduling of meetings and appointments. The SFCG Evaluation Manager will also ensure that all required documentation is made available to the Evaluator as required.

IX. Evaluation Team
The evaluation team will consist of the external evaluator, the SFCG Evaluation Manager (SFCG Pakistan DM&E Manager), the SFCG Asia Regional DM&E Specialist and the DM&E Manager at SFCG Headquarter, Washington DC. The final evaluation will be conducted under the overall supervision of the SFCG Pakistan Executive Director.

X. Experience and Qualifications
a. A minimum of a Masters degree in social sciences or a relevant field. An academic degree in peacebuilding will be desirable.

b. At least 5 years of program evaluation/implementation experience. Experience in conducting evaluations in peacebuilding and women related programs will be an advantage.

c. Work experience in Pakistan will be an advantage.

d. Spoken English and Urdu skills and required. Pushto speaking skills will be an advantage.

e. Excellent English writing skills.

f. Ability to work in challenging work conditions, and less than ideal security situations.

g. Knowledge of conflict sensitivity will be an advantage.

XI. Recruitment Process
A complete evaluation proposal along with a CV must be submitted to sbutt@sfcg.org no later than 7th of August, 2013. Please forward any questions regarding this Terms of Reference to the same address. The proposal should include:

- Evaluation technical proposal (Maximum of 10 pages, including methodology and tools)
- Evaluation financial proposal including budget estimate and price quote
- CVs of personnel
- 2 references
- Writing sample (preferably an evaluation conducted by the consultant recently)

If additional staff/assistants will be hired for the evaluation, please include their CVs as well. The evaluation must be completed within 40 days of signing the contract.
XII. Structure of the Report
The evaluator has to develop the structure of the evaluation report and get approval from the Evaluation Manager (DM&E Manager, SFCG Pakistan) before starting the report writing process.

Instructions for Submission
The deadline for the submission of applications is 7th August 2013. Only complete applications will be considered. If shortlisted, the applicant may be asked to give a presentation of their proposal.

A complete application will contain:
- Evaluation Technical Proposal
- Financial Proposal, including budget and price quote
- CVs of personnel
- 2 references
- Writing sample (preferably an evaluation study completed by the consultant recently)

Please submit the complete application in both soft and hard copies before the deadline. In case of any discrepancy, the hard copy will be treated as final.
Please e-mail the soft copy of the application to: sbutt@sfcg.org
Please post the hard copy of the application to PO Box 511, Islamabad.
### Annex B: The Logic Framework

**RESULT**

**Goal:** To increase the capacity of elected women parliamentarians as well as former and aspiring women councillors by magnifying women’s voices and bolstering engagement in decision making at the provincial and local levels.

**Specific Objectives**

**O1.** Elected women parliamentarians are equipped with coalition and consensus building skills and are able to advocate more effectively for a variety issues, including women specific issues.

**O2.** Trainers/facilitators from national women’s organizations are empowered as agents of reform and change and provide leadership training at provincial and district levels in Pakistan.

**O3.** The population’s awareness and perception of the role of women politicians as effective decision-makers in government is improved.

**Expected Outcomes**

**IR 1.** Elected women parliamentarians and future leaders trained to conduct consensus building activities

**IR 2.** Trainer/facilitators complete TOT in facilitation and conflict resolution skills and provide support to leadership trainees

**IR 3.** Media campaign and talk shows shift attitudes of public in favor of women’s role in policy decision making

**Outputs**

**Capacity building for media**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
<th>FREQUENCY OF DATA COLLECTION</th>
<th>TARGET (EOP)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% of women trained who increase their participation in decision making processes at provincial and district levels</td>
<td>Disaggregated by age, socio-demographics and level of activity (provincial or district)</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Beginning and end of the project</td>
<td>TBD according to baseline results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of participants who report use of conflict resolution skills for advocacy of policy change</td>
<td>Indicator measured through a survey and tracking of policy changes resulting from participant efforts</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>End of project</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of trainers/facilitators who conduct training at the provincial and/or district levels to expand leadership skills to current and future leaders</td>
<td>Pre and post training and after time has allowed for practice</td>
<td>Focus groups with trainees after time has allowed for practice</td>
<td>End of project</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of those interviewed in radio talk show listening range who report changed attitude toward women in decision making roles</td>
<td>Disaggregated by gender, age, type of media, place of work</td>
<td>Surveys</td>
<td>After the complete set of talk shows in each target area</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Capacity building for media**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
<th>FREQUENCY OF DATA COLLECTION</th>
<th>TARGET (EOP)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># of trainees who can identify three criteria for building consensus</td>
<td>Survey assessing knowledge and skill gain from training</td>
<td>Pre and post-test</td>
<td>At each training session</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of trainees who report use of conflict resolution and consensus building skills in community meetings</td>
<td>Focus groups with trainees after time has allowed for practice</td>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>End of project</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of women leaders trained with USG assistance (GJD 4.2)</td>
<td>Disaggregated by gender, age, type of media, place of work</td>
<td>Participants list</td>
<td>Collected after each training</td>
<td>TBD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Outputs**

**Capacity building for media**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
<th>FREQUENCY OF DATA COLLECTION</th>
<th>TARGET (EOP)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre/post survey with each training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus groups with trainees after time has allowed for practice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio station records on calls to talk shows</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Partners + 75 provincial + 80 district participants**
Annex C: Brief bio-data of the Evaluation Team members

1. Humera Hussain

I have 15 years of work experience in the development sector both in Pakistan and Afghanistan. I carried out evaluations for number of leading organizations in Pakistan including Aurat Foundation for its ‘Legislative Watch’ Project (that focused on building capacity of women legislators to table pro women bills and amendments’ in discriminatory laws at floor of House), Human Rights Commission of Pakistan for its project ‘Realizing Human Rights in Pakistan’ (under which the organization monitors the state of human rights in the country and prepares its flagship annual report). Norwegian Embassy’s ‘Gender Research Programme’ in Pakistan implemented by Social Policy and Development Center (SPDC). Furthermore; I worked for United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Pakistan as a Consultant for its project, ‘Strengthening Electoral Processes in Pakistan’ and developed several news bulletins on various aspects of Elections & Electioneering.

2. Dr. Virginia Khan

I have lived and worked in Pakistan since late 1999. My first exposure to governance and gender issues here took place when I led the team that researched and wrote the Year 2000 UNDP Human Indicators Report, titled ‘The Gender Question’. That report drew on data and analyses from 5 South Asian Countries, regarding the status, legal rights and condition of women. I acquired extensive Monitoring and Evaluation experience as the Program Manager for the National Rural Support Programme, Pakistan’s largest semi-Governmental organisation. As the Programme Manager for Gender at the Rural Support Programmes Network I was responsible for incorporating ‘gender’ into the strategies, governance structures and activities of the 10 Rural Support Programmes. I worked closely with the Consultant selected to design a Results Based Monitoring Program at Plan Pakistan. I have experience in identifying indicators for each step in a logic chain so that both indicators and outcomes are identified and linked with each other. I have designed numerous Internal Evaluations of programme activities.

I was the team leader early in 2013 for the external end of project evaluation of Oxfam GB’s ‘Raising her Voice’ project, implemented by the Aurat Foundation. That was conducted by H&H Consulting, Islamabad. I am currently completing the Draft Report for the Baseline Survey for the Danish Red Cross work in UC ‘Sarli Sacha’.

I have extensive experience in designing and refining survey instruments and identifying process and outcome indicators. I was the Senior Social Science Specialist, working for UNIFEM, which supported the Ministry of Women Development in preparing the 4th Periodic Report to the CEDAW Expert Team. That task required extensive interaction with Government and civil society actors and the drafting of a report that met the objectives of Government and Civil Society organisations.

In 2007-08 I was a co-author of an IDRC-funded research study titled ‘Gender, Power Relations and Decentralization in Pakistan’ which analysed the contexts in which elected women Councillors had functioned in Union, Tehsil and District Councils under the Local Government Ordinance. I have extensive experience in qualitative methods, including identifying relevant subject matter for, and researching and writing Case Studies. I also have extensive and diversified experience in high quality and complex report writing.
Annex D: Research Tools – Questions for SFCG Staff

1. MTE Questions for Executive Director SFCG

1. How does this project contribute to the SFCG country programme strategy?
   1a. Which Government policy on women does the Project contribute to most significantly?
2. As the Executive Director and the Head of Lead Consortium Organization what are the strengths of this intervention that you would like to share with us?
3. What bottlenecks have you and your team faced during the implementation phase?
4. Do you think the project has attained its planned goal? Please share examples.
5. Since you directly interacted with the target beneficiaries during various events, what change have you felt in their behavior and knowledge as a direct result of this intervention?
6. How practical is the consortium approach to implementing this project?
7. Do you think enough financial and human resources were allocated for the implementation of this project? Both at SFCG and at partners’ offices? If you faced any challenges please share.
8. What was the need for WILL branding? Did it achieve its purpose?
9. Which part of this intervention could have been done differently?
10. Would you specifically like to share the learning that you emphasized, as an organizational leader shall be carried forward for implementation in the next phase?
11. Is there any component in the project that you thought could have been done differently?
12. What sustainability measures are embedded in the project, so as the provided knowledge could stay with the target beneficiaries?
13. Have you received any feedback on the intervention from other organizations’ working in Pakistan on the same issue? Or were you (SFCG) invited in country by any institute to make presentation on this initiative?

2. MTE Questions for Finance Manager

- What financial management capacity building measures were taken for the partners, if any?
- Did the partners for SFCG grant, manage separate bank accounts?
- What anti-corruption measures, if any, were put in place?
- What type of checks and balances were put in place by SFCG as lead organization for implementing partners systems?
- What was the required frequency of having financial reports from the implementing partners? Were these requirements met?
- What was the required frequency to do donor financial reporting?
- What types of observations, if any, were received from the donor?
- What were the comments of the auditors on the report? Any management letter written?
- Who selected the auditors? Was it the partners, SFCG or the donor?
- What were the strong points in financial management of the partners and what should have been changed?
- Were there enough financial resources allocated for the project interventions? If there were any weaknesses please identify them.
- Is there any particular learning that you will like to share with us?
3. MTE Questions for SFCG Manager-Projects

For analytical assessment following questions are developed within the areas identified under the guidelines of OECD-DAC standards:

1. **Relevance/Appropriateness**

   - How do you think that the project’s stated goals and objectives cater the needs of women politicians in Pakistan and what could have been done differently?
   - Has this initiative added value and bridged any technical gaps in the skills of women politicians in Pakistan? Please give some examples. What was unique about this initiative?
   - Had the project covered the appropriate themes in domains of leadership and media messaging and were enough time and resources provided for capacity enhancement that would not otherwise happen?
   - What are the perceptions of your partners and beneficiaries on various project components and their mode of delivery?
   - What are the major lessons learned (about project management and about leadership, conflict resolution and media messaging) from this phase of the Project. When did you learn the project was going to be extended? What learning from this phase has been carried out for phase 2?
   - Is there any planned activity in phase 1 that you found less useful after implementation and you did not include it in phase 2?

2. **Effectiveness**

   - To what extent have the women’s leadership, conflict resolution and media messaging skills been improved after attending SFCG and its partners’ trainings and events? Is there any example that a participant talked about the practical challenges that they face as women in the central body of her political party? Similarly, is there any incident quoted from the participants, where they played some role in conflict resolution?
   - What do you think are the outcomes of WILL talk shows and the media campaign? Have they produced the planned results? Any direct feedback you received from the audience or the partners’ staff?
   - Have you received any information that participation of women MPAs and Ex Councilors have increased in their party decision making process as a result of SFCG initiative?
   - What capacity building measures, including trainings, have been taken to ensure that the partners’ project staffs deliver the planned outputs effectively? Are you satisfied that those measures have resulted in the skills being raised to the necessary levels? Is there more capacity-building to be done?
   - Whether the project ‘strengthening Women Parliamentarians in Pakistan for Effective Government’ has enabled women politicians to talk about women issues as a collective body above party lines? Please share examples.
   - What are the strengths and challenges that project faced during its implementation?
3. Impact

- Do you think that the project interventions have enabled the majority of the target beneficiaries to apply the acquired skills independently in their political career? For those who have not been able to apply their skills, what are the major reasons, and can those obstacles be addressed in Phase II?
- What changes have been found in the dealings of the media professionals i.e., radio producers/talk show hosts after attending SFCG trainings? Any examples.
- What changes have been found in the media handling practices/strategies of the women politicians?
- Have you recorded any change in the public perception, which you can attribute as the direct result of WILL?
- Do you think that SFCG intervention has brought any change in the media especially radio programmes way of handling women issues? Please share examples.

ANNEX E: QUESTIONS FOR PARTNERS’ INTERVIEWS

PAIMAN and INSAN Trust

- Any management hurdles in implementing the Project? (e.g. communication of concepts, funds transfer, timing of events and deadlines)
- Have you found the consortium approach efficient? Effective? Any problems encountered?
- Were there any hurdles in recruiting trainees? Did anyone refuse?
  - Did you have any problems getting the same participants to multiple training events?
- Please describe the process of designing the content of the training programmes
- What was innovative about the SFCG training? (donor reports ask for this but not given)
- How did you define ‘conflict’ for this project? Did that definition change over the course of the training sessions?
  - Were there conflict issues you felt you could not address? (beyond the scope of the project)
- How useful was the project TNA in designing the training? How was it useful?
- Can we see some of the training evaluations (participants’ feedback)?
- Would you say that the training rollout was effective? (if yes, what are the indicators?)
- If you were to design another training program in the future, with the same objectives, what issues would you address? (i.e. based on what you have learned during the activities)
- Were you able to identify any Provincial (or District) specific strengths and weaknesses during the project events? (training, Forums, coaching)? Ideas on the reasons for these?
- What were the hardest things to convey during the project activities?
  - the easiest? the most common questions and issues?
- Was there any media coverage of the project that was not initiated by the project?
- Which stakeholders have you interacted with on any aspect of the project?
  - Are there people you would have liked to interact with but could not? reasons?
- Can you give any examples of participants’ increased abilities over the course of the training events? have these been recorded anywhere?
- To what extent would you say that the Leadership Forum objectives had been accomplished?
  - e.g. the 4th Forum aimed to:
• “strengthen Vertical and Horizontal Caucuses and Networks of women leaders from across parties to research and advocate women’s agenda and to
• strengthen and empower women leaders in coming years to further women’s leadership and effective political participation – need for further training programs, coaching etc.
• Both Forums included media campaigns: 1st Forum aimed to “support a robust national campaign raising general awareness on and advocating for women’s political participation and leadership in Pakistan. 4th Forum = Steps for projection of positive leadership role and images of women-steps to engage with media more effectively”.
• Is there any documentation of the leadership forums other than in the QPRs?

Uks
• Any management hurdles in implementing the Project? (e.g. communication of concepts, funds transfer, timing of events and deadlines)
• Have you found the consortium approach efficient? Effective? Any problems encountered?
• How effective would say the Consortium had been in implementing the project, based on your experience?
• To what extent do you think the Project’s efforts to engage with the media were successful?
  o e.g. 1st Forum aimed to “support a robust national campaign raising general awareness on and advocating for women’s political participation and leadership in Pakistan. 4th Forum = Steps for projection of positive leadership role and images of women-steps to engage with media more effectively.
  o The Media Messaging w/shop.
• Were these efforts unique, in your professional experience?
• Describe the process you followed in designing the radio programs from concepts to content to identifying audiences
• How did you address issues such as different levels of understanding, different needs for information (e.g. basic and advanced)
• Did you link with any other media experts in designing the radio programs?
• To what extent were you able to incorporate any Province or District-specific issues (gender, conflict, development) into the programs?
• To what extent do you think the Project’s overarching media goal (i.e. using the media to “shift attitudes toward women’s participation in government and create greater awareness of issues effecting women allowing them greater participation, rights and justice”) has been accomplished to this point? Please give your reasons.
• How useful do you think the Effective Media Messaging Manual is? e.g. was it useful in designing the CG Media Messaging workshop (MMW)?
• What are the intended links between ‘media messaging’ and the WILL campaign? How do the information and publicity efforts tie in with each other?

ANNEX F: THEMES OF STAKEHOLDERS INTERVIEWS

Radio Producers

• The interviews with radio producers are going to be based on the ideas behind the design of the specific programs; the objectives of those programs; the reasons for inviting specific guests and the DJs’ opinions of the effectiveness of the programs in supporting the elected women and in creating a broader-based social acceptance of women as political actors. Some of the experienced DJs will be able to provide a comparative perspective on interviewing political actors, which may provide insight about the project. Where available, we will examine the radio stations’ ‘feedback forms’ and contact women and men who have provided these, to gain a sense of audience response.

Case Study Subjects
• The six success stories will address the women’s personal and professional histories, from their family backgrounds to their experiences as political party members and elected officials. We shall also include one case study of a Master Trainer and one of a Media Person either DJ or Radio Producer who has attended the training and designed/hosted the radio programme in the very framework for women political leaders (either parliamentarians, ex councilors’ of aspiring women leaders).

For women politicians who will be interviewed for success stories will be selected on the basis of the following criterion: belong to different political parties, have attended the maximum number of SFCG training and other events, not the subject of the success story before, willing to share her data and has taken some significant action in the light of acquired knowledge.

ANNEX G: FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION QUESTIONNAIRE

1. Name of your party?

2. The place you represent:

3. Please identify the SFCG activities you have taken part in. ________________

4. Have you also taken part in other (non SFCG) training programs for MPAs or women Councillors? If Yes please identify them __________________ (given by ____)

5. Is there anything that this project provides that those other programs have not?

6. Were you able to pass on what you learned (if any) to other women politicians? (elected or not?)

7. Are you a member of your Party’s Women’s Wing?

8. Do you agree w/the idea of a women’s wing? How is it better or worse for women politicians to belong to the women’s wing? Exec committee

Leadership, Conflict Resolution and Advocacy Workshops

1. Were these relevant to your political aspirations? How were they relevant? Any examples.

2. Were they relevant to your sense of being responsible to your constituents? Please give some details

3. Were they relevant to district level issues? details ______

4. Are there some issues beyond the capability of elected politicians to handle? If Yes, can you identify them?

Project Outcomes

1. What have you been able to get involved in as a direct result of attending the SFCG trainings?

2. Can you identify anything that you been able to accomplish since attending the trainings that you could not have accomplished before the trainings?

3. Which leadership skills would you say you have acquired from this project? Can you identify any leadership skills?
4. Can you identify a specific conflict (of any kind) that you have been involved in as an MPA (or Councilor)? Will you like to share if there is some conflict still going on and what strategies you are opting to manage?

5. Even if that conflict is still ongoing, will you please describe how you used what you learned in the training to become involved in the conflict? What was the result of your involvement? (details)

6. Did the sessions take account of levels of knowledge and the political and social issues you are dealing with? (p.14 TNA mentions “sufficiently complexity”)

7. Is there an example of an intra-party conflict that the project has enabled you to engage in? If yes, what was the outcome?

8. Please rank the following aspects of the training on a scale of 1-3

   1= not good enough, 2= sufficient for my needs, 3= very good

   • Increased my ability to understand political concepts

   • Strengthened my ability to advocate on any matter
     o Within my party
     o Within the women’s wing
     o With people I wanted to network with at a higher level (e.g. District with Provincial, Provincial with National)
     o To contribute to developing legislation
     o With civil society advocacy groups (including NGOs) outside the political domain (local in the District or bodies such as NCSW, WAF) Y N

   For any Yes responses, please give an example: ____________________

   • Strengthened my networking ability
     o To form alliances with other women politicians
     o To network on behalf of my constituents

Did the training sessions focus sufficiently on “effective political participation”

• For elected women?
• For representatives of your party’s women’s wing?

The participants in the TNA identified several issues that they wanted to have included in the training; please tell us your ranking on a scale of 1 – 3 of how well the training met your needs for these skills:
1 = very low  2 = sufficient for my needs  3 = very high

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>No. of Rankings</th>
<th>Comments or Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Developing communication skills/effective media handling</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing problem-solving skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing skills to be effective women political leaders</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enhancing decision-making skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing capacities to understand and frame political issues</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing capacities for conflict resolution</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Developing capacities for dealing with the media</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. Can you compare your experience of **building consensus**, before and after the SCFG training and media sessions.

9. What have you learned from the SFCG program that has helped you in consensus building?

Examples of efforts _____________  Examples of successes __________

(Training Outcomes – Agency and Social Change)
[In the TNA 34% of respondents said that lack of leadership qualities were the primary obstacle in preventing women representatives from being effective leaders. 22% identified ‘lack of political awareness’ as a major hurdle and about 20% said the ‘lack of self determination’ prevented women politicians from being effective.]

How would you describe the outcomes of the training programs in your own experience, in:  
• Developing leadership qualities
• Developing political awareness
• Improving self-determination.
Please give examples __________

Have your ideas about addressing conflict changed since you took part in this programme?
**Media messaging**

1. Did you participate in the radio programs in any way?
2. Does the video documentary include your constituency?
3. Have the WILL campaign activities reached your constituents? What feedback/comments have you received about those activities?
4. Do you use internet? If yes, which social media (Facebook, Twitter) you use? Have you visited WILL FB page or followed their Tweets? Is there any need for training in these media for you as a political actor?
5. Are you or who you know is WILL Ambassador?

**Training**

1. Were current and emerging issues included? Was the agenda arrived at in consultation with them? or was it pre-determined?
2. What was the ‘mix’ of gender and explicitly political issues covered in the content?
3. Did the workshops enable you to address significant local matters? (effectiveness)
4. Was the workshop enabled you to address the social and political issues in your constituency and with in your political party?
5. Did the training sessions you attended sufficiently address the Provincial or District issues (including security and conflict) that you are aware of? If yes, give examples.
6. Which of the SFCG training events was the most useful for you as a politician?

**ANNEX H: Materials Consulted**

1. **Literature review:** the Evaluation Team reviewed: the project proposal and log frame, the Training Needs Assessments (May 2012) reports, which functioned as a baseline against which to measure achievements; the Training manual on ‘Effective Leadership, Conflict Resolution & Advocacy’. We also reviewed seven (7) quarterly reports from SFCG Pakistan to the US Department of States Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor (DRL); the Coaching Manual and coaching reports, the concept notes for the four Leadership forums, the National Networking Summit report and the success stories generated by the project.

From the media perspective we reviewed the Media Messaging Manual, the radio programmes, a number of press releases, the Media Guide for Gender Sensitive Radio Programming and the video documentary titled *A journey of learning and leadership*.

2. **Discussions with SFCG Pakistan Management and Staff:** The evaluation team interviewed the Executive Director SFCG, the SFCG Manager Projects, the Finance Manager and the former Assistant Manager DM&E. The team also held discussions with the Monitoring & Evaluations Officer and the Communications
Manager, although both have been with the Project for a short time and were not as yet able to comment in any depth on the project.

We have had several discussions with the SFCG Pakistan staff in charge of logistics and arrangements for the visits to Peshawar, Lahore, Karachi and Quetta and for interviews in Islamabad, to be held after our return from the visits to the Provincial capitals.

**Annex I: Evaluation Action Plan**

The following matrix shares the methodological steps that were followed for the assignment and the significant dates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Oct. 23 to 25</td>
<td>All project documents: proposal and LFA, TNA baseline, monitoring and performance reports, training manuals, promotional campaign material and other materials developed under the initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews with SFCG and Partner staff</td>
<td>Oct. 28 to 30</td>
<td>Project staff, management and leadership of partner organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation of Inception report and Action Plan</td>
<td>Nov. 1st</td>
<td>Including methodology, finalised research tools and action plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field visits (Peshawar, Karachi, Lahore)</td>
<td>Peshawar: Oct. 31st Lahore: Nov. 4th and 5th, Karachi: Nov. 6th and 7th, Quetta: Nov. 8th and 9th.</td>
<td>FGDs and interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone/Skype interviews</td>
<td>Nov. 11th and 12th</td>
<td>With SFCG Asia Regional Programme Manager, DM&amp;E Manager and Headquarters Director L&amp;T.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compilation of field data, analysis and completion of first draft of the report.</td>
<td>November 20, 2013</td>
<td>Analysis incorporating findings, lessons learned from each Province and specific to each category of respondents, and recommendations for Phase II.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback and comments from SFCG</td>
<td>December 16, 2013</td>
<td>Incorporating first round of feedback From SFCG team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Draft report sent</td>
<td>Jan. 10, 2014</td>
<td>Second round of feedback incorporated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Draft report sent</td>
<td>Jan. 22, 2014</td>
<td>Final reviewers’ comments incorporated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>